

Attachment A

Capital Expenditure Comparison - Current Precinct Model/Voter's Choice Act Model

In the fall of 2018, the Fresno County Clerk/Registrar of Voters (County Clerk) released a Request For Proposal (RFP) seeking bids for a new voting system. This new system would include new servers and software for the administration of elections, accessible ballot marking equipment for precinct location voting, equipment for the central scanning of ballots and tabulating of results, and potentially the tabulation of ballots at precinct locations. Multiple vendors replied to the RFP.

Each vendor was invited to demonstrate their proposed system. Following the demonstrations, each vendor was asked to provide two clarified cost proposals following strict County equipment counts. One proposal was to satisfy the equipment needs of a new voting system in the current precinct model while the second proposal was to satisfy the equipment needs of implementing the new Voter's Choice Act (VCA) model.

The differences between the two proposals would be 250 additional precinct tabulators and 83 additional accessible ballot marking units for the current precinct model versus 50 ballot on demand equipment set-ups for the new VCA model.

One-time Equipment Costs	
Current Precinct model (268 precincts)	\$3.3 Million
VCA model (50 voting Assistance centers)	\$1.7 Million
One-time reduction in costs with VCA model	(\$1.6 Million)

As provided in the table above, purchasing the new voting system equipment for the current precinct model will cost approximately \$1.6 million more than purchasing the necessary equipment to implement the VCA model. The capital purchase will be offset with State and Federal grant funds. The State grant funds do have a match requirement; however, the Federal grant funds may be utilized for the match.

Attachment B

Ballot Printing Cost Savings – Precinct Model/VCA Model

Precinct Model:

Under the current precinct model, every precinct is required to have ballots on hand for 75% of registered voters in the precinct (Elections Code §14102(a)(1)). These ballots are delivered to the precincts the morning of the election by the Precinct Inspector and unused ballots are returned to the Elections Warehouse the evening of the election. Unused ballots are required to be controlled and destroyed as soon as possible (Elections Code § 14403).

In Fresno County, additional ballots are printed and held at the Main Elections Office located on Kern Street (beginning 29 days prior to an election) for distribution for vote by mail requests and conditional registration voters during the 15 days up to, and including Election Day. Enough copies of the ballot are ordered for this purpose to serve 15% of registered voters in each precinct. All of these “office” ballots that are unused must be destroyed following Election Code requirements.

Fresno County also orders a supply of ballots to be used during provisional and vote by mail processing to address physically damaged ballots, ballots with identifying information, or provisional ballots voted out of registered precinct. Ballots equal to 5% of the registered voters in each precinct are ordered for this adjudication purpose. Any unused ballots in this category must also be destroyed following Election Code requirements.

Below is a breakdown of unused ballot costs for the current precinct model.

Unused Ballots Destroyed in November 2018	
Precinct ballots	82,000
“Office ballots”	69,204
Adjudication ballots	<u>41,000</u>
Total unused ballots destroyed	192,204
Total cost of unused ballots (\$.28 per ballot)	\$53,817

Voters Choice Act Model:

Under the Voters Choice Act (VCA), counties are not required to provide pre-printed precinct ballots. Instead, Elections Code § 14102(c) requires that counties using the VCA model furnish “sufficient materials for voting”. Fresno County’s current Voting System RFP satisfies this requirement through a ballot on demand system. The respondents to the Voting System RFP and Fresno County’s current printing vendor estimate the cost saving per on demand ballot printed to be \$.08 each. In November 2018, 93,581 ballots were cast at the precincts.

Below is the detail cost savings realized with Ballot on Demand:

Ballot on Demand Savings	
93,581 ballots x \$.08 saving per ballot (VCA model)	7,486
Total cost of unused ballots (precinct model)	<u>53,817</u>
Total reduction in costs with VCA model	(\$61,303)

As provided in the table above, the total amount potentially saved under the VCA model due to not pre-printing precinct ballots would be \$61,303.

Attachment C

Voting Assistance Center Staffing Costs

Current Precinct Model Staffing – November 2018 (420 voting precincts):

The Election Coordinator position is a highly experienced field support staff that oversee approximately ten precincts per election. Each individual precinct requires the following staffing: one Inspector and a minimum of three County Clerk positions during major elections. Additionally specialized County Clerk positions may be required in consolidated Precinct locations. Below is a breakdown of these staffing costs.

Current Precinct Model Staffing Costs Per Election	
43 Election Coordinator positions	\$28,001
420 Inspector positions	\$77,770
1304 Clerk positions (including Students and Precinct Guides)	<u>\$197,884</u>
Total	\$303,655

Voter's Choice Act Staffing:

Under the Voter's Choice Act (VCA), Voting Assistance Centers will be activated in progression following legal requirements with an increase in staffing closer to Election Day. Based on the Act, starting ten days before an election and through the Friday before Election Day, one vote center is required for every 50,000 registered voters. On election day and the Saturday, Sunday, and Monday leading up to the Election Day, one vote center is required for every 10,000 registered voters. Based on this Fresno County will require ten Vote Centers open ten days prior to Election Day, plus Election Day. An additional 40 Voting Assistance Centers will be open three days prior to, plus Election Day.

VCA Staffing Costs	
11-Day Vote Centers	Staff Hours
10 Vote Centers X 7 days X 8 hrs. per day X 6 Staff per Vote Center =	3,360
10 Vote Centers X 3 days X 8 hrs. per day X 8 Staff per Vote Center =	1,920
10 Vote Centers X 1 day X 15 hrs. per day X10 Staff per Vote Center =	1,500
4-Day Vote Centers	
40 Vote Centers X 3 days X 8 hrs. per day X 8 Staff per Vote Center =	7,680
40 Vote Centers X 1 day X 15 hrs. per day X10 Staff per Vote Center =	6,000
Total staff hours	20,460
Staff Training: 500 Staff X 10 Training hrs. =	5,000
Total staff hours and training time	<u>25,460</u>
*Total cost of staff and training time	\$381,900

*Note – total staff costs based on MSF cost recovery for Extra Help staff.

Current Precinct vs. VCA Model Staff Ongoing Costs Per Election	
VCA model staff costs	381,900
Current precinct model staff costs	<u>303,655</u>
Difference	\$78,245 (additional ongoing costs for VCA model per election)

Attachment D

Additional Vote by Mail Ballot Distribution

Under the Voter's Choice Act (VCA) model, all voters will receive a vote by mail ballot which will result in an additional 174,000 vote by mail ballots mailed to those voters who have not requested one.

Breakdown of Additional Vote by Mail Ballots Required with the VCA Model	
Registered Voters in November 2018	455,000
Registered Voters receiving a vote by mail ballot	
Permanent Vote by Mail	(237,559)
Vote by Mail Precincts	(14,036)
Individually requested one-time Vote by Mail	<u>(29,763)</u>
Voters who did not receive a vote by mail ballot in November 2018	173,642

Under VCA, costs related to providing vote by mail ballots to these additional voters include:

Ongoing Costs of Additional Vote by Mail Ballots Required with the VCA Model Per Election	
\$.28 per ballot X 174,000 ballots	48,720
\$.50 per envelope and inserting per ballot X 174,000 ballots	87,000
\$.12 postage per ballot X 174,000 ballots	20,880
\$.66 return postage* per returned ballot (est. 50,356)	<u>33,235</u>
Total	\$189,835 (additional ongoing costs for VCA model per election)

*Return postage is .55 cents plus .11 cents service fee charged by post office. Election Code § 3010(a)(2), effective January 1, 2019, requires counties to pay return postage on all vote by mail ballots. The estimated 50,356 in returned ballots assumes this additional group of vote by mail ballots will be returned at a rate of 58%, with 50% of those being returned to drop off boxes and precinct locations. (Sacramento County reported 38% at drop boxes, 34% by mail and 28% at vote centers).

Under the VCA model, the additional cost associated with providing vote by mail ballots to all voters is based on the most recent available data. Data analysis indicates that there is an upward trend in the use of vote by mail ballots. If this trend continues, the cost difference would change.

Attachment E

Voter Outreach and Education to Implement the Voter's Choice Act

The Voter's Choice Act (VCA) requires participating counties to file and follow an education and outreach plan to prepare their citizenry for the voting method change. Each county must organize multiple committees, plan a series of community meetings, provide at least two direct contacts, as required by law, with each registered voter and provide a media plan to supplement the other activities. Counties are encouraged to hold additional educational outreach meetings, especially in conjunction with community groups.

Some portions of the education and outreach plan are at no or minor cost. For example, Sacramento and Nevada counties have reported improved participation and minor costs when effectively partnering with community organizations to hold educational meetings. Other portions of the education and outreach plan would require a large outlay of funds. The two direct contacts with registered voters, as required by law, are estimated to cost Fresno County approximately \$250,000 for two postcard mailings. Therefore, it is estimated that Fresno County will expend \$250,000 in one-time voter outreach and education.

There are grants and alternative funding sources available for education and outreach activities associated with the VCA. It may be possible to fully offset this cost in the short term.

The majority of the activities and responsibilities associated with this activity are not required as continuing activities beyond the implementation year of the VCA. Voter Outreach/Education has thus been listed separately in this cost comparison.

Attachment F

Supervisorial District Two - Special Election Comparison of Costs of Current Precinct vs. Voter's Choice Act (VCA) Model

Precinct Model utilized for March 5, 2019 Election

113,598 registered voters

78 precinct precincts, 9 mail precincts

71,596 vote by mail ballots issued (as of 2/21/2019)

VCA Model – Election Code § 4005(b) Requirements

2 vote centers open 10 days and Election Day

2 vote centers open Election Day only

8 drop boxes available 28 days prior to Election Day

All Voters receive a vote by mail ballot (currently 42,002 additional vote by mail ballots)

Operational Cost Comparison Current Precinct vs. VCA Model for Special Election for Supervisorial District Two	
Item	(Reduction)/Additional Costs
Precinct model ballot printing (see a below)	(20,740)
Voting assistance center staff (see b below)	(13,360)
Additional vote by mail ballots (see c below)	41,959
Paper roster and street index elimination	(2,275)
Provisional ballot processing elimination	(3,750)
Drayage of voting location materials	(3,425)
Voting location materials cost	(10,000)
Election night staff costs	(3,250)
Drop box staff costs	1,740
Training materials	(1,944)
Total operational cost reduction for VCA model	(\$15,045)

(a) Ballot Printing for Precinct Ballots

The estimated quantities of unused ballots for the Special Election for Supervisorial District Two are based upon the ordering requirements as described in Attachment B and the following assumptions: 30% participation for the election

Estimated Unused Ballots Destroyed in Special Election for Supervisorial District Two	
Precinct ballots	42,245
Office ballots	16,825
Adjudication ballots	<u>15,000</u>
Total estimated unused ballots destroyed	74,070
Total cost of estimated unused ballots destroyed (\$.28 per ballot)	(\$20,740)

(b) Precinct Center Staffing

Precinct Model Cost	
9 Election Coordinators	\$5,800
78 Inspectors	\$13,650
165 Clerks	<u>\$24,750</u>
Total staff costs for 87 precincts	\$44,200

Under the VCA, Fresno County would be required to provide two voting assistance centers beginning ten days prior to Election Day (open 8 hrs. a day) and two additional voting assistance centers open on election day (all four voting assistance centers would be open 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m. on election day). In addition, as of February 21, 2019, Fresno County would have been required to mail an additional 42,002 vote by mail ballots under the VCA model requirements.

VCA Staff Costs	
11-Day Vote Centers	
	Staff Hours
2 Vote Centers X 7 Days X 8 hrs. per Day X 6 Staff per Vote Center =	672
2 Vote Centers X 3 Days X 8 hrs. per Day X 8 Staff per Vote Center =	384
Election Day Vote Centers	
4 Vote Centers X 1 Days X 15 hrs. per Day X 10 Staff per Vote Center =	<u>600</u>
Total Staffing Time	1,656
Staff Training: 40 Staff X 10 Training hrs.	<u>400</u>
Total Staff and Training Time	2,056
*Total Cost of Staff and Training Time	\$30,840

*Note – total staff costs based on MSF cost recovery for Extra Help staff.

Current Precinct vs. VCA Model Staff Costs for Supervisorial District Two Special Election	
Precinct model Staff Costs	44,200
VCA model Staff Costs	<u>30,840</u>
Difference	(\$13,360) reduction with VCA model

(c) Additional Vote by Mail Distribution

Under the VCA, costs related to providing vote by mail to the 42,002 voters who have not received a vote by mail ballot for the special election include. The costs associated with the additional vote by mail ballots is detailed below.

Additional Vote by Mail Ballot Costs for Supervisorial District Two Special Election	
\$.28 print cost per ballot X 42,002 ballots	11,760
\$.50 cost per envelope and inserting per ballot X 42,002	21,001
\$.12 postage per ballot X 42,002 ballots	5,040
\$.66 return postage per returned ballot X 6300 ballots estimated**	<u>4,158</u>
Total additional costs	\$41,959

** This estimate assumes that the additional vote by mail ballots will be returned at a rate of 30% (similar to recent special elections in Fresno County) with 50% of those ballots returned by mail and 50% returned via drop boxes and voting assistance center drop off.