



Fresno County Advisory Redistricting Commission Summary of Proceedings

Thursday, October 21, 2021, 6:05 p.m.
Fresno County Health and Wellness Center
1925 E. Dakota Ave., Fresno, CA 93726
(In-Person and Virtual Zoom Meeting)

Commission Members

District 1:	<u>Katherine Burrows</u>	<u>Ken Abrahamian</u>
District 2:	<u>Elizabeth Kolstad</u>	<u>Lawrence Garcia</u>
District 3:	<u>Patience Milrod</u>	<u>Hugo Morales</u>
District 4:	<u>James Petty Jr.</u>	<u>Glenda Hill</u>
District 5:	<u>Suzanne Motte</u>	<u>Richard Gallegos</u>
CAO:	<u>Jeff Cardell</u>	

1. Call to Order

Commission convened at 6:06 pm.

2. Roll Call

Commissioners Present: Abrahamian, Burrows, Cardell, Gallegos, Garcia (late), Hill, Kolstad, Morales, Petty

Commissioners Absent: Milrod, Motte

The vote for Item 3 was taken out of order during Item 4 Public Comment, after Speaker 3.

3. Action and Discussion Items

- a) Approval of Minutes of the Commission's October 5, 2021 meeting (Action)

Motion and second to correct the name of Speaker 6 under Public Comments to read Kaya Herron and approve the Minutes of October 5, 2021.

Motion Carried: 9 Ayes 0 Noes 2 Absent

Commissioner Garcia joined the meeting during Item 4 – Public Comment.

4. Public Comment

This portion of the meeting is reserved for persons desiring to address the Advisory Redistricting Commission about matters within the jurisdiction of the Commission, but not listed

on this Agenda. Matters presented during the Public Comment Period cannot be discussed or acted upon by the Commission. Comments will be limited to three (3) minutes for each speaker unless non-English interpretation is needed, in which the speaker will be limited to six (6) minutes, with a total of 20 minutes allotted for the Public Comment Period. At all times, please use the microphone and state your name and affiliation, if any, for the record.

Public Comments:

- Speaker 1, Laurie Pesante, Delores Huerta Foundation: Commented about safety, the process, data problem, maps, and the possibility of scheduling another meeting, if needed.
- Speaker 2, Amy: Concerns about map compliance determination.
- Speaker 3, Kaya Herron: Recommended training and guidance, discontinue use of presentation slides regarding rules and goals, post specific fair maps criteria met, evaluate public input, eliminate map deviations of 10%, and prioritize presentation of maps.
- Speaker 4, Sarah Harris: Suggested using descriptions and not color coding when discussing maps.
- Speaker 5, Luis, CA Common Cause: Recommends consideration to revisit the accuracy of community testimony for the last two public hearings.
- Speaker 6, Pedro Navarro, District 3: Maps haven't changed for 20 years.
- Speaker 7, Ms. Rojas: Concerns about the mistreatment and silencing of the Hispanic community, and the right to be respected and heard.
- Speaker 8: Commented about politicizing this process.

5. Public Hearing and Public Input on Redistricting Process at 6:30 p.m. – Informational presentation regarding 2021 Fresno County Supervisorial Redistricting

a) Opening comments by staff and Chairman

b) Presentation by National Demographics Corporation (NDC)

Topics Include:

- Redistricting Criteria;
- Communities of Interest;
- Analysis of draft map proposals that meet Federal and State legal requirements.

Dr. Justin Levitt, NDC, gave an overview of the redistricting process and criteria.

c) Commissioner Comments: *Commissioners may provide comment or ask clarifying questions of staff or NDC regarding the presentation and draft map proposals.*

- John Thompson, NDC, read written comments submitted by Commissioner Milrod in her absence. Attorney Eropkin stated that Commissioner Milrod's written comments be considered public comments made and answered by County staff.
- Inquiries about Map 122 (NDC map).
- Why did NDC prepare 3 maps?
- Inquired about reporting commissioner comments during workshops (public comments vs. commissioner comments).

d) Public Comment: *The Commissioner will hear public comment on the presentation of draft maps, including public input on the composition of one or more supervisorial district boundaries and communities of interest. Any person addressing the Commission will be limited to a maximum of three (3) minutes unless non-English interpretation is needed, in which the speaker will be limited to six (6) minutes, so that all interested parties have an opportunity to speak.*

Chair Abrahamian acknowledged a memo received from the Inclusive Families Coalition and Equitable Map Coalition and will allow authors of proposed maps, additional time to explain their map.

Public Comments:

- Speaker 1, Cathy Brass, National Women’s Political Caucus of Fresno: Read a letter in support of the Equitable Coalition map.
- Speaker 2, Kimberly McCoy: Commented about displeasure with the redistricting process, lack of representation in West Fresno and Calwa, disadvantaged black communities, impact on zoning, packing and trucking, and Calwa should be included with the City of Fresno.
- Speaker 3, Mario, Northwest Area: Concerns about working class families need to be represented in northwest area, and in support of Fresno Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 4, Alex, Chief Counsel, Fair Representation Coalition of Fresno County: Author of map 101, the updated version of map 101 is compliant, and accommodates for future growth of Fresno County (Clovis and Southeast Fresno).

Recessed the meeting at 7:30 p.m., and reconvened at 7:45 p.m.

- Speaker 5, Terry Meyers, Southwest Fresno: Concerns about the lack of and need for black representation in Southwest Fresno, and in support of map 118.
- Speaker 6, Matthew, Fresno County: In support of Fair Representation map 101, and opposes map 116.
- Speaker 7, Mary Macias, District 16: Commented about a specific political party, and opposes the Equitable Coalition map.
- Speaker 8, Hasheed: Fair representation, and in support of the Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 9, Sarina: Commented about the responsibility of the Board of Supervisors and local City Council, and in support of the Fair Representation Coalition map 101.
- Speaker 10, Bea, District 2: In support of the Fresno Equitable Coalition map.
- Speaker 11, Executive Director of Jakara Movement: In support of map 117 and 118.
- Speaker 12, Leticia: The elementary and high school in her rural community share a cafeteria, should have their own cafeteria and not have to share.
- Speaker 13, Sanger resident: Opposes the Equity map as it breaks up communities of interest, concerns about the drought/water, and in support of the Fair Representation Coalition (FRC) map 101.
- Speaker 14, Matthew: Opposes the Equity Coalition map, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 15, Joel James, Kingsburg: In support of map 101, and opposes the Equity Coalition map.

- Speaker 16, David Serna: In support of the Equitable Coalition map submitted by the Delores Huerta Foundation, and the need for a Latino majority district.
- Speaker 17, Ruben: Diverse representation, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 18, Bernadina Hernandez, Sanger: In support of the map submitted by the Delores Huerta Foundation. Community needs include transportation and help for students, and in support of agricultural workers. Contractors
- Speaker 19, Pedro Cruz, District 3: Commented about District 2 and 5, in support of the Inclusive Families map 117 and 118, concerns about map 101, and mental health resources.
- Speaker 20, Patrick Murphy, Fresno: Opposes maps with partisan ties and financial support, suggests not supporting Equity Coalition map 116, and in support of the Fair Representation Coalition map 101.
- Speaker 21, Fred: In support of the Fair Representation map 101, and opposes partisan maps that favor one group over another.
- Speaker 22, Kaya Herron, District 5, Author of Map 118: Provided an explanation of and in support of map 118.
- Speaker 23, Ian, District 5: Opposes map 116, map 118 makes more sense, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 24, Norma Sandoval, District 4: In support of map submitted by the Delores Huerta Foundation, and concerns about the lack of lighting/street lights in the community.
- Speaker 25, Sean: Favors minimal changes, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 26, Grass Roots Strong 2.0: In support of minimal changes and the updated version of map 101, and opposes the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 27: Commented about segregation, some of the issues and comments made are the responsibility of the City Council and not the Board of Supervisors, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 28, Jasmine: In support of map 117 and 118.
- Speaker 29, District 4: In support of the Delores Huerta Foundation map.
- Speaker 30, Mr. Gomez: Responsiveness of the Board of Supervisors, concerns about racist statements, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 31 (via interpreter): The focus should be selecting a map that's good for everyone and the needs of the people, not be racially and politically motivated, transportation needs in Parlier, and in support of the Delores Huerta Foundation map.
- Speaker 32: Eric Rollins: Commented that race should not be the most important thing, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 33: The focus should be what is good for the people of Fresno, compliance with Federal and State law, differences in the east and west side of the valley, and in support of map 116.

Recessed the meeting at 9 p.m., and reconvened at 9:08 p.m.

- Speaker 34, Michael Evans: Concerns about map 101, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 35, Olga: Everyone deserves respect, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.

- Speaker 36, Diana: Commented about the Census, fair representation, and in support of map 116.
- Speaker 37, Representative of the Equity Coalition Map 118: Commented about the preparation of map 118, partisan data not used to create the map, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 38, Bea: Commented about map 116.
- Speaker 39, Delores Huerta Foundation: Intimidation and safety concerns (meeting attendee videotaping the speakers).
- Speaker 40, Alex Reyna: Opposes the Equity Coalition map, and in support of map 101.
- Speaker 41: Politics and race should be kept out of this process and all opinions should be respected.
- Speaker 42, Darcy, District 1: In support of map 116.
- Speaker 43, Angelica, ACLU: Commented about the letter submitted, cautioned against adopting a map similar to an existing map, and consider adding an additional public hearing to consider testimony received to better evaluate maps.

Attorney Eropkin stated there is not enough time for an additional commission public hearing, however there are two upcoming Board of Supervisor public hearings (November 2, 2021 at 1 p.m., and November 16, 2021 at 1 p.m.) to hear community testimony and submit written comments. The Board of Supervisors will make the final decision and adopt the map.

- Speaker 44, Ms. Gore: In support of map 117 and 118.
- Speaker 45, Stan, District 3: In support of the Equity Coalition map, and concerns about intimidation and safety, and attendees videotaping speakers during public hearings.
- Speaker 46, Josh: Commented about his recording and live streaming during the public hearings and meetings.
- Speaker 47: Commented about updated data on the Equity Coalition map.

Dr. Levitt, NDC addressed the Citizen Voting Age Population issue mentioned by Speaker 47.

e) Commissioners will discuss and vote on draft maps proposals presented by NDC to recommend to the Fresno County Board of Supervisors. (Discussion and Action)

Sonja Dosti, County of Fresno Public Information Officer, gave instruction to guide the Commissioners on map recommendations, and it was clarified that **all** maps submitted (including maps not recommended by the Advisory Redistricting Commission) will be forwarded to the Board of Supervisors.

Recessed the meeting at 9:54 p.m., and reconvened at 10:01 p.m.

Commissioner Discussion and Comments:

- Total of 22 maps.
- Map 102 and 116 are exactly the same, and map 102 will be crossed out.
- Map 106 is not contiguous, deviation over 60%, and not recommended for consideration.

However, the map author can revise and resubmit the map by 5 p.m. on October 22, 2021 for NDC evaluation and Board of Supervisors consideration.

- Map 109 and 110 population deviation is over 11%, and suggest removal for consideration tonight (Map author has the option to revise and resubmit the map by the deadline)
- Map 114 is not contiguous and the deviation over 47%.
- Map 104 and 113 decreases the majority/minority district, and not in compliance with the law.

Motion and second to remove map 102, 104, 106, 109, 110, 113 and 114 from consideration to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion carried: 9 Ayes 0 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second to recommend map 101 (as updated and pending analysis by NDC), 116, 118, 121 and 122.

Amended motion and second to recommend map 101, 116, 117, 118, 121 and 122.

Amended motion and second withdrawn.

Motion and second to recommend map 101 (as updated and pending analysis by NDC) to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion Carried: 9 Ayes 0 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second to recommend map 116 to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion Failed: 5 Ayes 4 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second to recommend map 118 to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion Failed: 4 Ayes 5 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second to recommend map 121 to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion Carried: 8 Ayes 1 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second to recommend map 120 to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion Carried: 6 Ayes 3 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second to recommend map 107 to the Board of Supervisors.

It was clarified that map 107 was submitted through District R and no author indicated, as it is not required for this mapping tool.

Motion Failed: 2 Ayes 7 Noes 2 Absent

Motion and second not to consider map, 103, 105, 108, 111, 112, 115, 117, 119, and 122 for recommendation to the Board of Supervisors.

Motion Carried: 7 Ayes 2 Noes 2 Absent

Commission Discussion:

6. **Announcements**

Upcoming Board of Supervisors Public Hearings:

- Tuesday, November 2, 2021 @ 1:00 pm – Fresno County Hall of Records, 2281 Tulare Street, Room 301, Third Floor, Fresno CA 93721
- Tuesday, November 16, 2021 @ 1:00 pm – Fresno County Hall of Records, 2281 Tulare Street, Room 301, Third Floor, Fresno CA 93721

7. **Adjournment**

Motion and second to adjourn the meeting:

Motion carried: 9 Ayes 0 Noes 2 Absent

The meeting adjourned at 11 p.m. The next meeting is scheduled on Tuesday, November 2, 2021, at 1:00 p.m. (Board of Supervisors Public Hearing), at the Fresno County Hall of Records, 2281 Tulare Street, Room, 301, Third Floor, Fresno.