

# Fresno County Advisory Redistricting Commission Summary of Proceedings

Tuesday, October 5, 2021, 1:00 p.m. Fresno County Health and Wellness Center 1925 E. Dakota Ave., Fresno, CA 93726 (In-Person and Virtual Zoom Meeting)

#### **Commission Members**

District 1:	Katherine Burrows	<u>Ken Abrahamian</u>
District 2:	Elizabeth Kolstad	<u>Lawrence Garcia</u>
District 3:	Patience Milrod	<u>Hugo Morales</u>
District 4:	James Petty Jr.	<u>Glenda Hill</u>
District 5:	Suzanne Motte	Richard Gallegos
CAO:	Jeff Cardell	

#### 1. Call to Order

Commission convened at 1:12 p.m.

## 2. Roll Call

Commissioners Present: Abrahamian, Burrows, Gallegos, Garcia, Hill, Kolstad, Milrod, Morales, Motte, Petty

Commissioners Absent: Cardell

Public Comment was heard out of order after the close of the Public Hearing (Item 5) and recess at 3:25 p.m. (reconvened at 3:34 p.m.)

#### 3. Public Comment

This portion of the meeting is reserved for persons desiring to address the Advisory Redistricting Commission about matters within the jurisdiction of the Commission, but <u>not listed</u> <u>on this Agenda</u>. Matters presented during the Public Comment Period cannot be discussed or acted upon by the Commission. Comments will be limited to two (2) minutes for each speaker unless non-English interpretation is needed, in which the speaker will be limited to four (4) minutes, with a total of 20 minutes allotted for the Public Comment Period. At all times, please use the microphone and state your name and affiliation, if any, for the record.

Public Comments:

• Speaker 1 (Michael Evans): Concerns about curtailing public input, a fair and transparent process, show of community support at the meetings, and in support of the Equity Coalition

map.

- Speaker 2 (Mr. Guyona, District 5): In support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 3 (Laurie Pesante): Audio/video public meetings and workshops be kept on file for 10 years on the Redistricting website, and concerns about Spanish interpretation (specifically map interpretation) during the meeting is problematic, all voices matter and should not be considered redundant, and will work with NDC on Fresno total population discrepancy.
- Speaker 4 (Catalina Navarro, Sanger): COI: Keep farm working communities of Sanger, East of Highway 41, Orange Cove, Selma, Del Rey, Southeast Fresno and Calwa, in support of Equity Coalition map, especially the District 4 map.
- Speaker 5: Be patient with the residents who take the time to speak, has submitted a map and will submit a second map, and commented about Pinedale, Tarpey and Mayfair.
- Speaker 6 (Ronald Martin): In favor of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 7 (Julius Rasmussen, Jr., Clovis): Commented about gerrymandering, the redistricting formula used, commissioner selection process, arriving at a conclusion, and would like to see details on how the conclusion was reached.
- Speaker 8 (Mai Tao, Southeast Fresno): Commented about the process for the Hmong and Southeast Asian community, process not the best and had to organize their own meeting to best represent their community, and in support of both the Equitable Coalition map, and the Fresno Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 9 (Angel Ruiz): In support of the Equitable Coalition map.
- Speaker 10 (Oliva Sideman): Commented about the public comment during meetings, agenda format, communities of interest, and in support of the Equitable Coalition map.
- Speaker 11 (Kya): In support of the Inclusive Families map. Meetings times not convenient or accessible to everyone (today for example), questioned prescreening of maps (NDC), staff assigned to accurately capture COI testimony and post to the website and accessible to all (current video format not compatible with screen readers), and summary of proceeding contain errors and lack significant detail.
- Speaker 12 (Lourdes Medina, District 3): Commented about the diverse area of Shields and Maroa where homes are now rental properties, and in need of more bus stops, access for elderly community, broader job opportunity information access, Commission not limit the communities right to speak, and in support of the Equitable Coalition map.

Item 4a was heard out of order after Item 2.

## 4. Action and Discussion Items

a) Approval of Minutes of the Commission's August 12, 2021 meeting (Action)

Motion and second to correct the Minutes of August 12, 2021, to add Chair Abrahamian's statement that he will reach out to schedule a meeting with Common Cause.

Motion Carried: 10 Ayes 0 Noes 1 Absent

Item 4b was heard out of order, and after the conclusion of the Public Hearing – Commissioner Comments.

b) Receive update from Chair Abrahamian regarding contact with Common Cause (Receive and File)

Chair Abrahamian reported on his contact with Common Cause. The discussion included presentations, public outreach, communities of interest, and community involvement and engagement.

Report received and filed.

c) Presentation on current Supervisorial District Boundaries (Receive and File)

Presentation received and filed.

The Public Hearing was heard out of order at 1:15 p.m., after Item 4a.

 Public Hearing and Public Input on Redistricting Process at <u>1:15 p.m.</u> – Informational presentation regarding 2021 Fresno County Supervisorial Redistricting Topics Include:

• Redistricting Overview;

- Redistricting Criteria;
- Communities of Interest;
- Redistricting Software;
- Redistricting Timeline and;
- Redistricting Efforts

Dr. Tilton gave a brief overview of the redistricting process.

**Commissioner Comments:** Commissioners may provide comment or ask clarifying questions of staff or the consultant regarding the informational presentation.

- 7 maps submitted, and one more to be submitted: Does NDC have a draft map?
- What is NDC's process for analyzing the maps received?
- Will NDC prepare a map even if one of the maps is fully compliant?

Dr. Tilton clarified that NDC does not have a draft map. 10 maps have been submitted (8 to District R, and 2 from the Equitable Coalition and Fresno Inclusive Families). Based on data, input and public comments from hearings, workshops and County staff (not the Board of Supervisors), NDC will determine if an additional map is needed. The Commissioners will select the final 5 maps and make a recommendation to the Board of Supervisors, who will make the final decision to adopt the maps.

**Public Comment:** The Commission will hear public comment on the informational presentation, including public input on district boundaries and communities of interest. Any person addressing the Commission will be limited to a maximum of two (2) minutes unless non-English interpretation is needed, in which the speaker will be limited to four (4) minutes,

so that all interested parties have an opportunity to speak, with a maximum of 30 minutes allocated to public comments on the presentation.

Public Comments:

- Speaker 1 (Ofelia Ochoa, District 1): Commented about services for families and the community.
- Speaker 2 (Pedro Navarro): Commented about supporting his map submission, Punjabi and Hmong communities. Communities of Interest: Northwest Fresno, Old Fig Garden & Van Ness, apartments by San Jose and Brawley, and Old Fig Garden has more in common with Clovis.
- Speaker 3 (Laurie Pesante): Urged support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 4 (Norma Sandoval): In support of the Equity Coalition map. Safe streets, sidewalks, parks and support for youth, jobs, and affordable housing. Communities of Interest: Baroda, Southeast Fresno, Coalinga and Riverdale,
- Speaker 5 (Arianna): Concerned about the redistricting process, a letter from the ACLU, and meetings should be held at dates/times accessible to everyone.
- Speaker 6 (Kya, District 5): Fair and accurate representation for Sunny Side and West Park. COI: (1) Sunny Side (Western Boundary-Peach Avenue; Eastern Boundary-De Wolf Avenue; Northern Boundary-East Clinton; and Southern Boundary-East Jensen), has less in common with majority of current district (rural northeastern area), and more in common with center of the city and southeastern areas Sanger, Fowler, Parlier, Reedley and Orange Cove. (2) West Park (Southern Boundary-West Central Avenue; Western Boundary-South Cornelia; Northern Boundary-West Shields; Eastern Boundary-South Peach.
- Speaker 7 (Estella Ortega): Lack of recreational activities, parks within walking distance, sidewalks, lights, and bicycle lanes. In support of the Inclusive Families map, and dissatisfied with day/time (1 p.m.) of today's meeting, as it's not convenient for most people working a normal workday.
- Speaker 8 (Kimberly Munson, District 1): Lincoln Heights: Jensen and Elm, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 9 (Olga, District 4 and Sanger/Parlier Community): Commission must listen to and not try to silence the community, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 10 (Socorro, Planned Parenthood): COI: East and West County division of rural areas Highway 41, Southeast Fresno in District 4, Clovis (foothill and mountain areas), Willow Avenue as border between Fresno and Clovis and District 2 and 5; proposed Central Fresno and North Fresno (Highway 99) grouped together. Keep the westside whole. South
- Speaker 11 (Olivia Sideman): Commented about the letter and 29 COI maps sent, Cantua Creek, El Porvenir and Lanier in the same western district, and Tombstone with eastern communities.
- Speaker 12 (Sean Felton, District 1): Commented about northwest area, and in support of Fresno Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 13 (Mark Quintos, North Central Fresno/near Hoover High): COI: (1) Group Old Fig Garden, Woodward Park, Clovis West, Buchanan neighborhoods and other parts of North Fresno and North Clovis together; and (2) Group Highway City, Herndon, Pinedale, El Dorado, apartment buildings near Fresno State and Tarpey Village in Clovis together.
- Speaker 14 (Imelda Cruz, Fresno resident): Lack of communications to the Latin

community, and that community needs to be represented and included in all the maps.

- Speaker 15 (Parlier, District 4): Lack of respect for Hispanics, insufficient interpretation, two minutes not enough time for speakers, and feels the commissioners did not look at the packet. Her community has the least services, no public transportation, water is terrible, they deserve respect and their voices heard.
- Speaker 16 (Heather Evans, Fresno City): COI: Marks and Gettysburg, South of Shawn, north of Ashland, train tracks west to the 99 continue to be included with western communities, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 17 (Eric Payne, Central Valley Urban Institute): Disappointed no African American commissioner, those communities kept whole, be seen and heard, have equitable representation, and elevate the Fresno Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 18 (Ms. Lau): COI: Keep Sunny Side Hmong community whole (currently split in District 3, 4, and 5) Willow and Jensen East to Clovis and Jensen; Lanare (District 4), Cantua Creek (District 1).
- Speaker 19 (District 2): Concerns about water restrictions, institutions that waste water, and the need to appointment someone to handle water waste issues in District 2.
- Speaker 20 (Armando Garcia, District 2 near Valentine/San Jose, North Redlands): Maps should uplift and reflect working families (including North Fresno), does not feel adequately represented by the current District 2 Supervisor, and in support of the Fresno Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 21 (Al Harrison, Northeast Fresno): Approve a diverse and inclusive map, keep Northeast Fresno, North Fresno, and North Clovis together, and in support of the Fresno Inclusive Families map.
- Speaker 22 (Mr. Lopez, Fresno): West of highway 99 and South of McKinley Avenue in Fresno, Mendota area, agricultural cities in Fresno County would be best for field workers. Also, South County, Southeast of Fresno, rural Parlier and surroundings, and in support of Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 23: COI: Southeast Fresno, Del Ray, Selma. Mostly Hispanic, water is bad, high taxes, need better sewage system, a hospital and more colleges.
- Speaker 24 (Ronald Martin, Fresno-District 5): Boundaries-Highway 99, San Joaquin River and Willow Avenue, does not identify with District 5 and Clovis, and should be in the Fresno district.
- Speaker 25 (Dr. Humberto): In support of Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 26 (Delia Espino, Caruthers): No changes to Caruthers in at least 16 years, the city needs lights posts, paved roads, 2-way street striping, lack of stop signs which have caused accidents. Need more opportunities for farmers, especially near Cherry and Conejo, more commercial centers that will bring jobs, parks with bathrooms, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.
- Speaker 27 (Dee Barnes, Mayfair Area): Keep the following similar communities in the central urban Fresno area in one district: Downtown Fresno, Chinatown, Cultural Arts district, Jefferson neighborhood, Tower district, Mayfair area, Blackstone corridor, Huntington Blvd., Asian communities, Fresno, McKinley, Weldon, and the Kings Canyon corridor. Boundaries should also move further North: Kings Canyon to the South, Ashland and Gettysburg to the North, Highway 99 on the West, and Clovis Avenue on the east, and in support of the Equity Coalition map.

- Speaker 28 (Mai Tao, Southeast Fresno): COI: Hmong and Punjabi communities overlap, Chestnut and Peach (West), Clinton and McKinley (North), Temperance and De Wolf (East) and Jensen (South). Fresno Unified, Clovis Unified and Sanger Unified at the convergence of 3 supervisorial districts, not interested in being divided, and need to keep it as whole as possible.
- Speaker 29 (Daniel): Commented on Fair Maps and Voting Rights Act, provided some demographic statistics, and in support of the Equitable Coalition maps, and bias.
- Speaker 30 (Gary Lasky): Commented about transparency, Fair Maps, Civil Rights, and Voting Rights Act, and paying attention to COIs. COI: District 4 combines Highway 99 south of Fresno, Calwa to Kingsburg, and includes Reedley and Sanger. District 5 includes foothills, former farmland, and keeps Clovis in-tact, and in support of the Fresno County Equitable Map Coalition.
- Speaker 31 (Lou Silva, CA Common Cause): Public comments and COI testimony (September 29, 2021 meeting) not reported accurately, wrong terminology (used the word "farmer" instead of "farmworker"), items misspelled and misidentified., misspelled words. Request accurate recording, continuity of public comment period, and clarity on maps and missions.
- Speaker 32 (Dr. Bernice Curry, District 3): Don't split up the West Fresno and black communities, and in support of the Fresno Inclusive Families map.

Dr. Tilton announced there are minor changes to the data set tables for the Equitable Map Coalition map submitted today, and will be posted before the Public Hearing on October 21, 2021. He also announced that Item 4c was included and discussed during his Public Hearing presentation (Item 5).

The meeting recessed at 3:25 p.m., and reconvened at 3:34 p.m.

Commissioner Milrod, Petty, and Morales left the meeting before hearing Item 6.

#### 6. Announcements

Upcoming Commission Public Hearing:

 Thursday, October 21, 2021 @ 6:05 pm – Fresno County Health and Wellness Center, 1925 E. Dakota Ave., Fresno CA 93726

Upcoming Board of Supervisors Public Hearings:

- Tuesday, November 2, 2021 @ 1:00 pm Fresno County Hall of Records, 2281 Tulare Street, Room 301, Third Floor, Fresno CA 93721
- Tuesday, November 16, 2021 @ 1:00 pm Fresno County Hall of Records, 2281 Tulare Street, Room 301, Third Floor, Fresno CA 93721

All maps will be available on the website for the public to view, approximately 7 days prior to the October 21, 2021 Public Hearing. At the Public Hearing on October 21, 2021, the Commissioners will receive discuss and determine the maps for recommendation to the Board of Supervisors for final approval.

### 7. Adjournment

Motion and second to adjourn the meeting:

Motion carried: 7 Ayes 0 Noes 4 Absent

The meeting adjourned at 4:22 p.m. The next meeting is scheduled on Thursday, October 21, 2021, at 6:05 pm (Public Hearing), at the Fresno County Health and Wellness Center, 1925 E. Dakota Ave., Fresno CA 93726.